### Scientific evidence base for transactional analysis in the year 2010

### Annex 2 – the Psychotherapy List: References to research on Transactional Analysis psychotherapy effects 1963-2010

© 2010 Thomas Ohlsson

60 of the 88 references found in this list were found to be unique studies of treatment effects of TA psychotherapy. They are marked *.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Effectiveness</th>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Design</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>School study, no significant effects after 6 weeks.</td>
<td>0*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>CT-design. See also Bader (1982).</td>
<td>+*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>CT-design. TA with redecision techniques found effective.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>CT-design. Groups of TA/Gestalt and behavior modification both tested. Sign. better than control groups after 12 sessions in private outpatient psychotherapy.</td>
<td>+*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. CT-design. Sign. change in locus of control but not in writing skills. School study, not therapy.</td>
<td>+*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. No information about results.</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>Meta-analysis, TA effective as a group therapy, not as good as CBT or medication, but better than IPtherapy (Khalil). In Kahlil’s(2007) master list of 19.</td>
<td>+*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>CT-design. Unclear if it is TA-therapy by a qualified TA-therapist. 5 day student workshop on TA gave more FC, A and NP. Probably E, not P. In Kahlil’s(2007) master list of 19.</td>
<td>+*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. TC-design. 8 months TA group therapy for hospital sisters, post measure one year after finish. Sign. differences in self esteem and self satisfaction in experimental group.</td>
<td>+*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments:</td>
<td>RCT-design. 12 weeks of Rational Behavior Therapy, Psychodrama, TA, discussion or testing only. Self-actualization or behavior did not change in any group.</td>
<td>0*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comment: One year TA community treatment for 12 schizophrenics. Significant results for lower depression and schizophrenia. In Khalil’s(2007) master list of 19. +*


Comments: Focus in TC program was TA, sample population 58 federal prisoners involved in the Askelepion Therapeutic Community for a minimum of 12 months. TA effective, significant changes in self concept as measured by variables from MMPI and CPI. +*


Comments: 68 heroin addicts tested with Adjective Checklist (ACL) prepost 18 days of hospital based treatment (not TA-oriented). Ego state changes from AC to A could be verified, and ACL can be used to measure ego state changes. NA


Comment: One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. No information on results. ?


Comments: RCT-design for study on aggressive children. Rated as one of the seven best TA-studies in Elbing, U. (2007). A search for transactional analysis studies according to Evidence Based Medicine (EBM) criteria, *EATA Newsletter* 90 (Oct.). Study not mentioned in Khalil (2007). Doubtful from abstract if it is a study of TA at all, seems to be a communication (transactional) study of mother-child relationships. NA


Comment: CT-design, 13 couples, 6 in TA and 7 in “eclectic” group marital counseling. No significant changes in self concept and some other variables. 0*


Comments: 56 therapy clients tested prepost with ACL and Brief Symptom Inventory (BSI). Predicted changes in most ego states occurred at significant levels. Study tests the ego state construct, not therapy effectiveness. +*


Comment: 12 “worst problem” high school students participated in TA “personal growth” class one semester. Significant drop in discipline referrals and truancy. Sign. Improvement of grade average. Study supports that TA can be used as an effective educational approach with socially maladjusted high school students. +*


Comment: Ego states were found to be highly significant phenomena when tested on 10 TA therapists. NA


Comment: RCT design, 11 in experimental group and 17 in control. Changes were not significant. 0*


Comment: Study found a significant relationship between ego states and psychopathology. NA


Comment: RCT design, 8 in each group. Both treatments equally effective beyond 0.01 level in reducing depression, TA also increased NC and NP scores. +*


Comment: See above. In Khalil’s (2007) master list of 19. 2


Comments: RCT-design. Significant reduction of intensity and frequency of headaches in experimental group (those who received bio-feedback and TA training). +*


Comments: RCT-design. Rated as one of the seven best TA-studies in Elbing, U. (2007). A search for transactional analysis studies according to Evidence Based Medicine (EBM) criteria, *EATA Newsletter* 90 (Oct.). Not mentioned in Khalil (2007). A TA group once a week was (a small) part of both the long term and the short term treatment program, and there was no effort in the study to identify the effectiveness of the TA group. It was not the purpose of the study to evaluate TA, and the study is not relevant as a TA effectiveness study. NA

Green, G. (1988). Analysis of research on the effectiveness of transactional analysis for improving marital relationships: Towards close encounters of the single kind. Transactional Analysis Journal 18, 238-248. Comment: All quantitative studies on the effectiveness of TA for improving marriages were reviewed. “…it cannot be said that TA is effective or ineffective in producing positive changes in the relationships of married couples. The only possible conclusion is that the jury is still out, and the burden of proof is on the proponents of TA.” In Khalil’s (2007 master list of 19. 0*


Intarakumnerd, T. (1976). The effects of transactional analysis on the self-concept of Thai students who are enrolled in Mississippi universities. Ph.D. dissertation, Mississippi State University. Comment: One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. N=50, RCT design, 4 weeks of TA training (6 hours altogether). Some significant effects on self concept were found. +*


Jesness, C.F. (1975). Comparative effectiveness of behavioral modification an transactional analysis programs for delinquents. Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology 43, 758-79. Comment: One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. Simple group comparison study. Rated as one of the seven best TA-studies in Elbing. U. (2007). A search for transactional analysis studies according to Evidence Based Medicine (EBM) criteria, EATA Newsletter 90 (Oct.). Mentioned but excluded from review in Khalil (2007). Large study over four years of 983 juvenile delinquents sentenced to treatment at institutions. TA treatment program compared to behavior modification program. Both programs were significantly better than other similar programs. ++


Kahn, F. (1973). Transactional analysis and gestalt therapy: A comparative study. Ph.D. dissertation, California School of Professional Psychology. Comment: TA and Gestalt were compared in literature and through questionnaires to practitioners. Both were found to be existential and process oriented incomplete systems. NA

Kapur, R., Miller, K. (1987). A comparison between therapeutic factors in TA and psychodynamic therapy groups. Transactional Analysis Journal 17, 294-300. Comment: Study asked clients in TA groups and psychodynamic groups to identify helpful therapeutic factors. Both groups ranked self-understanding highest. TA was high on interpersonal learning and psychodynamic participants on universality and cohesiveness. NA

Knox, T. (1973). The effect of transactional analysis groups on the internal-external locus of control. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Arkansas. Comment: One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. Excluded from Khalil (2007). Groups of students with different ways of learning TA (workshop, class) were compared with students that did not learn TA. Both TA group members and TA class members made significant changes from “externals” to “internals” (in charge of own feelings and destiny). +*


Comment: RCT-design, 54 college students in 3 groups, TA, desensitization/relaxation, placebo. Both treatment groups significantly better in reducing anxiety, shifting locus of control to internal, improving achievements. TA also significantly better in improving low self-esteem. *+*


Comment: Large study of 10 group therapy forms, n=210, in 17 groups. RCT-design, TA included with two groups, one of which was led by Bob Goulding and had best results while other TA group was the second worst group (personal inf. from Bob Goulding) *+*


Comment: After 10 weeks of TA therapy FC was significantly strengthened. *+*


Comment: One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. RCT-design. N=74. No significant results. *0*


Comment: Study of marathon with Bob and Mary Goulding. See also McNeel (1982). *+*


Comment: Found significant positive effects of the marathon after three months. N=15. In Khalil’s (2007) master list of 19. *2*


Comment: Explored the applicability of the Collective Parenting Function (CPF) Model to a TC for alcohol dependent clients. Was confirmed. NA


Comment: n=28, one week workshop. No standard instruments, no controls. No measurements reported. Positive changes reported. *+*


Comment: N=21, one week workshop by Mary Goulding and Muriel James. Instruments used but results not given in numbers. Significant positive short time changes claimed. In Khalil’s (2007 master list of 19. *++*


Comment: Therapy results by transactional analysts were compare to results of psychiatrists, psychologists, social workers, marriage counselors and physicians in earlier large survey (n=248 for TA, 2900 for earlier study). Found significant better results for TA than other groups, and more than 6 months of therapy sign. better. In Khalil’s (2007) master list of 19. *++*


Comment: Previous study replicated for TA’s part with 27 international therapists and 932 clients of TA therapy. Results the same as in previous study. In Khalil’s (2007) master list of 19. *++*


Comment: "Unobtainable" study in Khalil (2007). ?


Comments: Result of this project incorporated in Ohlsson (2001, 2002). TA rated as main treatment ingredient in TC for drug addicts with psychotic problems by both clients and staff. *++*


Comments: Original work – see also Ohlsson (2002). *++*


Comments: Simple group comparison study. Rated as one of the seven best TA-studies in Elbing, U. (2007). A search for transactional analysis studies according to Evidence Based Medicine (EBM) criteria, EATA Newsletter 90 (Oct.). 67 clients in TC with TA psychotherapy followed in all therapy over 20 months. Follow up average 2 years after. Significant results: >80 therapy sessions better, complete therapy process better, more competent therapists better. *2*

Comments: Compares effects of TA with behavioral therapy and combined therapy. RCT-design. Rated as one of the seven best TA-studies in Elbing, U. (2007). A search for transactional analysis studies according to Evidence Based Medicine (EBM) criteria. *EATA Newsletter 90* (Oct.), n=113, about 30 days of treatment. Behavior therapy significantly better than TA, but combined TA/behavior group best of all. No significant differences after 1 ½ years. Study written by behavior therapist in study. Abstinence was criterion. In Kahlil’s (2007) master list of 19. + (-)*


Comments: RCT-design. N=48. TA did effect significant positive change in self concept. +*


Comment: No information ?


Comment: n=358, RCT design. TA group had significantly better results than control group. In Kahlil’s (2007) master list of 19. +*


Comment: Participation in 2½ hours groups produced no significant changes. 0*


Comment: Study excluded from Kahlil (2007). ?


Comment: n=8. Study found agreement between clinicians using TA and clinicians using psychoanalytic ideas in diagnosing. NA


Comment: n=24. Biochemical changes in of tryptophan uptake significantly different in recovery of schizophrenia using TA treatment (Schiff). +*


Comment: n=86. Found drop in tryptophan uptake in schizophrenics treated at Cathexis Institute compare to Lafayette Clinic in Detroit. 2


Comment: RCT-design. N=60. Both groups improved over time in grades and behavior. +*


Comment: Groups with more than 120 hours of TA/Gestalt therapy showed significant increase in positive self-perception and self-integration compared to control groups. +*


Comment: Study of affective and working alliance in long term psychotherapy. NA


Comment: Analysis of epistemological positions followed in doing TA psychotherapy and counselling. NA


Comment: CT-design. TA group significantly better in "usefulness of math" +*


Comment: Describes a group where Berne was leader that met for more than 6 years, and where a questionnaire follow up was made 30 years later. Positive experiences, group add something that wasn’t there before any didn’t harm. N=17 +*


Comments: Same group, n=9. Participants felt that what happened was important and interesting. +*


Comment: Meta-study of 475 controlled psychotherapy studies, including 9 TA studies. TA found to have an effect size of 0.67, close to the average of the study, placing TA as about as effective as psychodynamic therapy, behavior modification and client centered therapy. Study in Kahlil’s (2007) master list of 19, but none of the individual studies were included. +*


Comment: Simple group comparison design. TA/Redecision group found effective. +*


Comment: “Unavailable” in Khalil (2007). ?


Comment: No information. ?


Comment: RCT-design. N=30, 3 groups., 5 weeks of treatment (40 hours). TA groups had significant decrease in anxiety and depression as well as increase in developed internality. +*


Comment: Marathon TA therapy was found to produce greater initial change and ongoing TA group therapy was shown to produce greater change later 2/3 of the treatment period. +*


Comment: n=146 college students, randomized Solomon four-group experiment. Significantly better adjustment in TA groups. In Khalil’s (2007) master list of 19. +*


Comment: Research on effectiveness of TA as communication method in nursing homes. N=30 staff members. After 9 months of coaching after 101 experimental group had better insight into communication between staff and residents. In Khalil’s (2007) master list of 19. +*


Comment: Interview with 14 subjects 4 years after short term in-patient TA therapy. 12 received more therapy after leaving, good results of first therapy did not hold for some. 0*


Comment: RCT-design, n=128. Compliance in booster session, which included TA, was significantly better than in reintegration training +*


Comment: Excluded from Khalil(2007). NA


Comment: n=149, questionnaire study, descriptive. 84% found TA training improved marriage. In Khalil’s (2007) master list of 19. +*


Comment: n=22, volunteer university students and staff, CT-design, 15 hours TA self reparenting (6 weeks). Significant increase in self-esteem etc. In Khalil’s (2007) master list of 19. +*


Comment: Matched CT-design., n=26. A TA reparenting group performed significantly better than a psychoanalytic group in adaptive functioning and changed positively in mental status. +*


Comment: One of nine TA-studies in meta analysis by Smith et al 1980. CT-design. All three groups of students improved significantly in self-concept, social adjustment and grade point (two groups). “TA...is a beneficial training tool for elementary school students”. +*


Comment: n=81 university students decreased significantly in external locus of control after taking part in one semester of TA class. NA